

**GLENDALE CITY COUNCIL
GOAL SETTING AND STRATEGIC PLANNING RETREAT
NOVEMBER 10, 2005**

PRESENT: Mayor Scruggs, Vice Mayor Eggleston, Councilmembers Clark, Frate, Goulet, Lieberman, and Martinez.

ALSO PRESENT: Ed Beasley, City Manager; Craig Tindall, City Attorney; Pam Kavanaugh, Assistant City Manager; Pamela Hanna, City Clerk and Carol Nalbandian, Facilitator

Mayor Scruggs opened the meeting at 10:00 a.m.

INTRODUCTIONS AND OVERVIEW OF SESSION

Ms. Nalbandian introduced herself and gave a brief overview of the session. The Mayor, City Councilmembers, City Manager, and Assistant City Manager introduced themselves and gave brief personal/professional biographies.

DEVELOPING A COMMON VISION

Dreams About the Community

Ms. Nalbandian asked Councilmembers to share their dreams for the community that they would like to see in five to ten years.

Councilmember Goulet said nighttime activities in the downtown area restaurants, entertainment and businesses.

Mayor Scruggs agreed with Councilmember Goulet and added one or more parking structures in the downtown area.

Councilmember Frate and Vice Mayor Eggleston agreed with Mayor Scruggs.

Councilmember Clark stated police patrolling neighborhoods.

Councilmember Lieberman also identified police patrolling neighborhoods.

Vice Mayor Eggleston said established neighborhoods age beautifully.

Mayor Scruggs and Councilmembers Clark and Frate stated they had that dream written down as well.

Councilmember Martinez added that neighborhoods are diversified both in ethnicity and age of residents.

Councilmember Goulet said he had written down a mix of housing in the downtown area.

Councilmember Martinez stated he also had affordable housing.

Councilmember Clark said she had older neighborhoods become gentrified.

Councilmember Lieberman stated Luke Air Force Base is still operational.

Vice Mayor Eggleston added children return and settle down in the neighborhoods where they grew up.

Mayor Scruggs said she also had Luke Air Force base and added greater partnership.

Councilmembers Clark and Martinez agreed.

Councilmember Frate stated old businesses flourish and new businesses are established. He said he also wrote down affordable housing.

Mayor Scruggs said employment takes giant strides, attracting high paying, high quality jobs to allow residents to both work and live in Glendale.

Councilmembers Martinez and Frate said they also had written about attracting high quality, high paying jobs.

Councilmember Goulet added an efficient and effective transit system.

Councilmember Goulet said he envisions an efficient multi-modal system.

Councilmember Clark added congestion is eliminated on surface streets.

Councilmember Martinez said he also mentioned congestion.

Councilmember Lieberman stated he has a light rail multi-modal system for Grand Avenue.

Vice Mayor Eggleston said the area around the arena and stadium grows to be a busy, happy and interesting area and traffic does not impose on the surrounding neighborhoods.

Councilmember Clark agreed.

Mayor Scruggs also agreed, adding the area is generating revenue as projected.

Councilmember Clark agreed.

Councilmember Clark said the city is fiscally sound. The city is doing quite well at the moment, with a healthy unappropriated fund balance which she would like to see continue.

Mayor Scruggs and Councilmembers Martinez, Lieberman and Eggleston agreed.

Councilmember Martinez said his dream would be that Glendale is recognized for its quality of life, its top police and fire departments, its sanitation services and amenities.

Mayor Scruggs and Councilmembers Lieberman and Eggleston agreed.

Councilmember Lieberman stated the sugar beet factory becomes a museum and art gallery.

Councilmember Frate added the City is aggressive in purchasing properties along Glendale Avenue for commercial/retail revitalization.

Mayor Scruggs and Councilmembers Clark, Eggleston, Goulet, Lieberman and Martinez agreed.

Councilmember Clark added a more aggressive approach is taken to scalloped streets since they affect traffic flow.

Mayor Scruggs agreed.

Councilmember Lieberman said he also had buying and revitalizing properties.

Mayor Scruggs commented she wants people to feel as safe in Glendale as if they were in Lawrence Kansas where Ms. Nalbandian had told them people don't lock their doors.

Councilmember Martinez said he wrote down the city has the lowest crime rate.

Councilmembers Clark and Frate agreed.

Councilmember Goulet added a strong industrial business park complex close to the downtown area, but possibly in multiple locations. He emphasized that they must be clearly designated so as to attract businesses.

Councilmember Martinez agreed.

Mayor Scruggs noted she had also written down that Glendale is recognized as the number one city.

Vice Mayor Eggleston added the Loop 303 is complete with a solid office/commercial district, providing good jobs for citizens and sales tax increases that benefit the city as a whole.

Councilmembers Lieberman, Frate and Martinez said they also had that as one of their dreams.

Councilmember Martinez stated speeding in neighborhoods is under control.

Councilmember Clark agreed.

Ms. Nalbandian shared a story about England's use of cameras to monitor traffic, stating a friend of hers said, while the cameras may not have reduced the number of fatalities, it has had a significant impact on the number of people who break the laws.

Councilmember Lieberman said he wants the courthouse and police station on 47th Avenue and Glendale completed in the timeframe set forth in the CIP.

Mayor Scruggs and Councilmembers Martinez and Frate agreed.

Councilmember Frate stated city employees will keep pace with staffing levels.

Mayor Scruggs said she would like to see mega events accepted as a way of life and that they no longer dominate the city's decision making.

Councilmembers Lieberman and Eggleston agreed.

Councilmember Goulet stated educational opportunities that reflect society's needs and allow young people to secure employment.

Councilmember Clark said all county islands are eliminated through annexation.

Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

Councilmember Martinez stated the city is recognized as a model for its vision, governance, openness, and connectivity with and civility towards its residents.

Councilmember Lieberman said Glendale rises to number three in terms of the number of police officers and prosecutors per 10,000 citizens.

Councilmember Frate stated he would like Glendale to be less reliant on other water resources and have the necessary technology to be able to use its contaminated wells.

Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

Mayor Scruggs added neighborhoods are connected with each other and the government, empowered, and given access to programs offered by the government. Areas of the city are free of rivalry.

Councilmember Clark agreed. Neighborhoods talk to one another and the government, sharing common visions and goals.

Mayor Scruggs clarified she would like to bring people together, empower them, and build understanding among the residents regardless of where they live within the city.

Vice Mayor Eggleston agreed.

Councilmember Martinez stated he believes that will happen when amenities are found in all areas of the city.

Councilmember Goulet added strong, accessible, and affordable healthcare services that attract people to Glendale for treatment.

Councilmembers Lieberman and Martinez agreed.

Councilmember Clark said the 83rd Avenue Park is completed.

Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

Councilmember Martinez added a performing arts center has been established in the city.

Councilmembers Clark and Lieberman agreed.

Mayor Scruggs stated Murphy Park is still a center for family events and tourism.

Councilmembers Lieberman, Eggleston and Frate agreed.

Councilmember Lieberman said a new city hall that consolidates all city offices in one location.

Mayor Scruggs stated that barrio development issues are settled. Some groups' want commercial and some residential, we need to confront and resolve these issues. She also stated Bell Road is still a destination and revenue generating area.

Councilmember Frate agreed.

Ms. Nalbandian asked city staff if they have any dreams not already mentioned.

Mr. Tindall said he believes everything has been covered. Ms. Kavanaugh and Mr. Beasley agreed.

Ms. Nalbandian asked Mayor Scruggs, Ms. Kavanaugh, Mr. Beasley and Mr. Tindall to spend some time at lunch identifying common themes from the dream comments. She asked the Councilmembers to identify common themes they see among the list of dreams.

Councilmember Lieberman said community oriented.

Ms. Nalbandian suggested strong neighborhoods as a theme.

Mayor Scruggs said a strong business community and economic development.

Councilmember Goulet stated a strong downtown.

Councilmember Martinez said fiscally sound.

Councilmember Frate added constituent services.

Councilmember Martinez offered revitalization which the Council felt fell under strong neighborhoods.

Ms. Nalbandian emphasized the dreams listed will not be accomplished in one year or one term in office so Council Members have to be willing to be part of the legacy.

The meeting recessed for lunch.

The meeting reconvened at 1:00 p.m.

Ms. Nalbandian said there are a lot of commonalities among the list of dreams so she is proposing six strategic goals: Strong neighborhoods, Economic Development, A Vibrant Downtown City Center, Luke Air Force Base, A Financially Sound City, and High Quality City Services. She stated the words "One Community" seem to capture the vision, encompassing a high quality of life, diversity, and a place where residents can both live and work.

Councilmember Lieberman suggested they revise the vision to say a place where residents can live, work and recreate.

Mayor Scruggs pointed out every community has a similar catch phrase and it does not mean anything.

Council Member Clark agreed, stating any five people would have come up with the same strategic goals.

Ms. Nalbandian agreed, stating they need to add substance to the goals.

Ms. Nalbandian said the phrase “One Community” can mean different things to different people and, while she has seen the same goals identified in other cities, she has not seen the same combination of goals. She explained the uniqueness becomes clear when they set the direction for the near term. She said the goals should be similar to those found in other cities.

Councilmember Goulet agreed, stating success will come by their reaching a consensus on their top priorities and following through.

Councilmember Martinez said he believes it is important to provide recreational amenities so residents do not have to leave to find those amenities.

Ms. Nalbandian agreed, stating what she is hearing is that they want residents to be able to do everything in Glendale. She encouraged the Council Members to consider the six categories she identified as possible strategic goals.

Councilmember Clark said what is important are the priorities they set under each of the strategic goals.

Ms. Nalbandian agreed.

Mayor Scruggs explained they chose to set Luke Air Force Base apart as its own category because Glendale has a responsibility to national defense to do what it can to ensure Luke Air Force Base maintains its mission. She said, furthermore, Luke is the largest employer in the city and exceeds the next five businesses in the state in terms of economic impact. She stated, while Luke is definitely an asset, it also represents a huge responsibility.

Councilmembers, Clark, Frate, Goulet and Martinez agreed Luke Air Force Base should be its own category.

Councilmember Lieberman disagreed, stating, without Luke most everything else would fall through the cracks. He agreed Luke is an important piece.

Ms. Nalbandian asked the Council if they believe the six strategic goals identified capture their discussion.

The Council agreed that they do.

Fears About the Community

Ms. Nalbandian explained she does not want their fears to simply reflect the flip side of their dreams, stating she wants to know what they fear most could happen over the next ten years and what would make each Council Member really depressed, mad and/or upset.

Councilmember Martinez said his biggest fear is that a severe economic downturn will happen and the city will not be prepared to weather it.

Councilmember Lieberman identified two fears, a national recession and the closing of Luke Air Force Base.

Councilmember Frate mentioned not being prepared for a terrorist attack.

Mr. Tindall said not having sufficient water supplies.

Mayor Scruggs stated her biggest fear is that Westgate fails. To Councilmember Frate's concern she added other natural or manmade disasters.

Councilmember Goulet said he fears it will become too costly for people to live in Glendale.

Councilmember Clark echoed Councilmember Frate's and Mayor Scruggs' fear of a major disaster.

Ms. Kavanaugh and Mr. Beasley both said they also fear not being prepared for an economic downturn.

Ms. Nalbandian commented fears can be just as important as dreams because they bring to light those things the city feels it must avoid at all cost.

Councilmember Martinez said he has always been afraid that a disaster will occur at the nuclear plant and people will not know what to do or where to go.

Councilmember Clark commented a chemical disaster involving the railroad could be even worse.

Councilmember Frate said the city needs to look for areas of weaknesses or vulnerability and make sure they are strengthened.

SETTING STRATEGIC GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

Ms. Nalbandian showed the Iceberg Model of City Work, explaining the top of the iceberg represents the city's vision for its future. She pointed out the vision is the top of the iceberg because it is the most visible by citizens both inside and outside of Glendale. She said after the vision comes modernizing the organization where staff identifies initiatives that emphasize efficiency and innovation. She commented 80 percent of what the city does occurs below the surface of the water, hidden to ordinary citizens. She said the only time people notice these routine activities is when something goes wrong. She explained the relationship between the things that fall above and below the waterline, pointing out those things initially identified as goals eventually move below the surface and become part of the city's routine operation. She said as

those items become part of the routine, the city either needs to grow or eliminate other routine activities and therein lies the challenge. She spoke about a situation in Texas where a city had big dreams of a sports complex. She said the community got behind the dream and built a huge playground and picnic area in the middle of the sports complex. She stated, unfortunately, they did not have the money to manage the day to day operations of the complex and it sat unused for two years. She cautioned the Council to be careful what it dreams for.

Ms. Nalbandian asked the Council members to write down what they think they can do to move toward accomplishing the strategies over the next 12 to 18 months. She emphasized the list of strategies at this point is not prioritized and all should be considered equal. She clarified if something is already in the works and they are happy with the progress being made in that area, there is no need to put it on the list or they can simply write "continue as proceeding" under that strategy.

Strong Neighborhoods

Vice Mayor Eggleston suggested they increase funding for street paving and right-of-way maintenance.

Councilmember Martinez suggested they implement a pilot photo radar project.

Councilmember Lieberman suggested increasing police patrols, making their presence more visible.

Councilmember Frate suggested hiring more employees to maintain city-owned properties.

Mayor Scruggs said they need to stay focused on the Citizen Education and Empowerment Program.

Councilmember Goulet stated they need to continue funding Neighborhood Partnership so they can maintain services.

Councilmember Clark suggested they designate neighborhoods that are more than 50 years old as historic neighborhoods, explaining doing so would provide impetus for revitalization and gentrification efforts.

Vice Mayor Eggleston said they need to maintain historic preservation funding.

Councilmember Martinez suggested exploring mitigation methods for controlling speeding in neighborhoods.

Mayor Scruggs suggested they increase the emphasis on commercial centers that are located at the entrances to neighborhoods and increase their efforts to bring businesses in that complement the neighborhoods. She explained some neighborhoods have had

commercial centers for years, but the businesses in those centers are not conducive with the neighborhood and are not considered quality neighbors. She pointed out the Neighborhood Partnership Program originally had a commercial center component. She suggested they refocus the Neighborhood Partnership Program to include the entire community, including commercial centers, churches and businesses.

Councilmember Goulet said they need to maintain and increase neighborhood participation.

Mayor Scruggs said the programs under the umbrella of Glendale University, including mediation, block watches and Homeowners Association training, are key to encouraging participation in the neighborhoods.

Councilmember Martinez brought up the idea of having an ombudsman, explaining the Governor's Office uses their Ombudsman as a liaison between the city and those who feel they may have been mistreated or did not receive services they deserve.

Mayor Scruggs asked Councilmember Martinez if the intent would be to direct those people who comment during the public comment portion of the Council meetings to the Ombudsman. Councilmember Martinez said not necessarily, explaining the person would simply be someone citizens could turn to when they feel the city is not addressing their concerns.

Vice Mayor Eggleston suggested Councilmembers now act as Ombudsmen.

Economic Development

Councilmember Lieberman said he would like the city to leave GPEC and use the money it saves to do its own economic development. He said they could set up offices in San Diego, San Francisco, St. Louis and other cities.

Councilmember Frate suggested they start purchasing vacant properties and buildings to make them more readily available for development.

Mayor Scruggs expressed her opinion the city's economic development plate is full over the next 12 to 18 months.

Councilmember Martinez recommended they start setting money aside for the downtown area.

Councilmember Goulet said, while there is a lot of vacant land in the downtown area, a lot of land is also being inappropriately used. He suggested they relocate some of those businesses and acquire the land for redevelopment.

Councilmember Clark agreed the city's economic development plate is full.

Mr. Beasley asked if relocating businesses would entail condemnation, which would require the city to revisit its eminent domain and condemnation policy. Councilmember Martinez expressed his opinion it would, but only on a case by case basis. Councilmember Clark and Mayor Scruggs agreed the city should not go down the road of eminent domain. Mayor Scruggs said, however, there could be opportunities that would not require eminent domain. Councilmember Goulet said his intent was to handle the issue on a case by case basis. He suggested some businesses would be willing to leave if they were given incentives to do so. Councilmember Clark expressed her opinion if they follow that concept they would need to include Glendale Avenue as far out as the stadium and arena.

Vibrant Downtown

Vice Mayor Eggleston suggested they earmark funding for a parking garage.

Councilmember Martinez recommended they revisit Design and Zoning codes to find ways they can help older buildings come up to current standards.

Councilmember Lieberman suggested they develop a plan to purchase the Sugar Beet Factory and vacant car dealerships, noting many dealerships will relocate to the Loop 303.

Councilmember Frate recommended they follow up on the study the city did with regard to implementing a dining district.

Mayor Scruggs said I want to build a parking structure or at least have it under construction in the next 12 to 18 months. The civic center is going to go out of business there is no place to park that breakfast yesterday showed us the need for parking. Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

Councilmember Goulet said they need to develop plans for commercial development above the first floor in the downtown area. Mayor Scruggs pointed out the city's guidelines restrict commercial activity to the first floor.

Mayor Scruggs said she wants to fulfill the CIP timing for the Police Department headquarters and City Court.

Councilmember Goulet stated they may need to look at incentives to attract businesses to the downtown area.

The meeting recessed for a short break.

Luke Air Force Base

Mayor Scruggs said they need to keep supporting Luke Air Force Base and its mission and meet their needs in a timely manner.

Councilmember Goulet questioned whether there is a real understanding among the community of the value of Luke. He said educating the public will be key.

Councilmember Clark said they need to continue their efforts to ensure federal funding of Luke.

Councilmember Lieberman agreed, stating they need to be on a much friendlier basis with Arizona representatives. He stated strong states will be the ones that get the missions during the next round of BRAC.

Mayor Scruggs noted state legislators want to overturn legislation that was put in place to protect the base. She suggested the city find a passionate lobbyist to fight for the city's and Luke's interests.

A Fiscally Sound City

Mayor Scruggs said they need to continue to ensure honesty in the budget process. She said Council wants and needs true costs and realistic analyses.

Councilmember Goulet stated they also need timely disclosure of the practicality of implementing projects.

Councilmember Clark said they need to maintain the contingency fund they have been able to build up over the past few years and be conservative in their estimates.

Councilmember Martinez agreed, stating the city's General Fund balance should not go below \$50 million for the next 12 to 18 months. He pointed out the CIP already has cost overruns of \$8 million.

Mr. Beasley noted the city will have to dip into the General Fund balance to cover construction cost increases; however, those costs are included in the \$8 million Councilmember Martinez mentioned.

Councilmember Lieberman said they need to view the budget as though the city is in a crisis to see where it can be contracted or expanded.

High Quality City Services

Councilmember Clark stated they need to find funding that will allow the city's Police and Fire Departments to grow. She pointed out when mega events take place the city will need police and fire personnel both at the event and in the neighborhoods.

Councilmember Martinez suggested they create a special police unit to respond to hot spot areas in the city.

Councilmember Lieberman noted a Selective Enforcement Unit is supposed to respond to hot spot areas. He agreed the city must expand the number of officers.

Councilmember Frate suggested they consider increasing staffing levels throughout the city.

Mayor Scruggs said she wants the city to resolve outstanding issues in the Police Department, for instance, the selection of a new Police Chief, building morale, and providing opportunities for advancement.

Councilmember Goulet suggested the city continue to evaluate the job classifications to ensure the services provided match the job description.

Councilmember Clark recommended they develop a plan to address the issue of private water companies in newly annexed areas.

Councilmember Martinez suggested they evaluate the Planning Department to see if changes need to be made to their development services. He expressed his opinion the department needs more space and additional staff.

Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

Mayor Scruggs said they also need to evaluate the Human Resources Department, noting they seem to receive an inordinate number of complaints.

Mayor Scruggs stated she wants to complete the Emergency Operations Center on time and at full plan.

Councilmember Clark stated she still sees problems with Code Enforcement. She spoke about a particular situation wherein Code Enforcement took it upon itself to initiate a focus project on an older neighborhood where the developer had poured the concrete driveways on a particular development of duplexes up to the front door. She said the officers handed out more than two dozen tickets during the focus project, despite the fact that people had been parking next to their front doors for 30 years. She stated Code Enforcement later admitted they may have made a mistake, but it speaks to the problem.

Councilmember Lieberman expressed his opinion Code Enforcement Officers are afraid to issue citations.

Councilmember Clark emphasized the need for consistency and fairness.

Mayor Scruggs said they also need to understand the neighborhoods.

Councilmember Clark commented Code Enforcement often gives up trying to resolve a situation before they look to see if other courses of action could be taken. Councilmember Lieberman agreed.

SETTING PRIORITIES

Ms. Nalbandian provided each Council Member with dots and asked them to place the dots beside their highest priority items, noting they can place only one dot per item.

Mayor Scruggs asked Mr. Beasley and Ms. Kavanaugh if they feel any of the actions identified seem unrealistic to accomplish in a 12 to 18 month period. Mr. Beasley marked off getting out of GPEC and having the city do economic development on its own, explaining they could not open offices throughout the country in such a short period of time.

The following items were marked with five or more dots: start purchasing properties and buildings in the downtown area; earmarking funds and constructing a downtown parking structure; fulfilling the CIP timing for the Police Department Headquarters and City Court; and timely disclosure of the practicality of projects.

The following were marked with four dots: Continuing to fund neighborhood revitalization; relocating some businesses or underutilized properties to other locations and incentivizing them to move; developing a process to meet Luke Air Force Base needs quickly; continuing to ensure federal and state support for Luke, establishing friendly relationships with state and federal legislators and enhance lobbying efforts; continuing honesty in the budget process through identification of true costs and realistic analyses; and improving code enforcement through an enhanced understanding of neighborhoods.

Ms. Nalbandian asked staff their opinion of the items marked. Mr. Beasley said, while all of the items are doable, some policy discussions will be required.

Mr. Tindall asked what Council foresees doing with the buildings it purchases.

Ms. Nalbandian said the Council has started a process that will now go back to staff for further refinement. She asked each member if they can support the top priorities identified. The Council members indicated they could.

Ms. Nalbandian said the Council has set the strategic goals and the Chief Administrator and Management Team will develop an action plan to achieve those objectives. She asked how the Council is kept updated on things that are happening within the city. Councilmember Goulet said they receive quarterly status reports. Mayor Scruggs said they also receive reports from the City Manager. Ms. Nalbandian suggested they incorporate a status report on the high priorities into the quarterly report Council receives. She asked the Council members to think about the process they have started and to formally adopt the high priority items and make them available to the public. She

said the Council will have to deal with its issues before it will be able to move forward, but the Council has demonstrated that it can work together. She stated, while they may not all agree on the tactics to be taken or on the policies to be implemented, their efforts should be on the future and on the vision.

WRAP UP

Ms. Nalbandian asked each member to comment on what they feel was accomplished during the session and what they feel was of value.

Vice Mayor Eggleston said Council was able to reach consensus on several important items.

Councilmember Martinez said the session showed that they could work together and come together on things that really matter to the citizens.

Councilmember Lieberman said they worked together to come up with a list of viable goals.

Councilmember Frate said Ms. Nalbandian asked questions that are not typically asked and everyone contributed to the discussion. He stated the process also brought to light some things that he had not previously thought about.

Mayor Scruggs said the process validated the importance of some of the projects already in process. She noted there was a time when management of the city just gave Council whatever it wanted to keep them happy, stating that is not the way to run a city. She emphasized the need for staff to be brutally honest.

Councilmember Goulet stated they created an interesting pyramid of what is important.

Councilmember Clark said the exercise was very interesting and, while she is disappointed in some ways by the safe choices that were made, a consensus was achieved.

Ms. Nalbandian said innovation will come if they continue to do the exercises.

Councilmember Martinez suggested they go through a similar process every year.

Councilmember Lieberman and Mayor Scruggs agreed.

Mayor Scruggs said the city has to be very careful financially because of the overall economic environment. She said, while future situations may allow them to be more aggressive, she believes they have created an honest reflection of what they are able to do now.

Ms. Nalbandian emphasized the importance of the Council Members talking to one another in an informal setting.

Councilmember Frate said, unlike in some cities, the goals they set are achievable.

Mr. Tindall explained Council is restricted by law from having opportunities to talk informally.

Ms. Kavanaugh expressed her opinion the timing of the session was perfect, stating it will help staff significantly as they move forward with the budget process.

Mr. Beasley thanked the Mayor and Council for their willingness to participate in the session. He commented on the value of identifying the Council priorities, stating they drive the CIP, the budget and the city's business plan. He stated the public will also have a way to track the progress of each goal. He said, while the city can be innovative and creative, the fundamentals have to be put into place first.

Ms. Nalbandian said she enjoys her work because it affords her the opportunity to work with individuals who are truly dedicated and committed to their communities.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:55 p.m.